



Search Committee Training

Blanca Lupiani

Executive Associate Dean of Faculties

Spring 2017

Today's agenda



- Helpful resources
- Starting the search
- Evaluating the candidates
- Hosting interviews
- Making the hire
- Special considerations for international faculty
- After the hire

Helpful resources



- Dean of Faculties Hiring guidelines and Forms
 - <http://dof.tamu.edu/Hiring>
- University Rule 12.99.99.M1
 - <http://rules-saps.tamu.edu/PDFs/12.99.99.M1.pdf>
- Recruitment and Retention for Faculty Diversity: A Handbook for Search Committees
 - http://dof.tamu.edu/dof/media/PITO-DOF/Documents/Guidelines/handbooks/search_comm_handbook.pdf
- Guidelines on Faculty Hiring Process
 - http://dof.tamu.edu/dof/media/PITO-DOF/Documents/Guidelines/hiring/guidelines_for_hiring_faculty.pdf

Search committee



- Representative
 - Within department
 - External constituencies?
- Diverse
 - Title/rank
 - Focus area
 - Demographic
- May lead to conversations that expand the definition of “**strong candidate**”
- Increases professional network and may contribute to a diverse candidate pool
- May draw stronger consideration by UR candidates

Search committee



“The job of the *search committee* is to conduct and active search, NOT to passively open envelopes from applicants”

- *Basic recruitment strategy*: advertise and wait
- *Enhanced recruitment strategies*: reach out to UR professional organizations
- *Active recruitment strategies*:
 - make direct contact with graduate students, faculty and key institutions to build relationships over time
 - cultivate both current and future applicant pools that include strong representation of UR faculty

Search



*“Good search practices result in a good hire, and they are **fair to women and men, underrepresented and majority candidates**”*

Faculty hiring



TWO ROUTES

- Search
 - Authorization to recruit: approved by college dean
- Waiver
 - Approval
 - non-tenure track approval by college dean
 - tenure-track/tenure on arrival approval by DoF
 - Justification
 - Partner placement
 - Target hire
 - Emergency hire
- Authorization to Recruit: sent to Dean of Faculties to post with Texas Workforce Commission (TWC)

Defining a faculty position



- Tenure-related searches affect the future of the department and the university for decades to come
- Defining the position has long-term implications
- Discussion of an upcoming faculty positions is an opportunity to review current and future directions within the discipline/professional field and the department

Position announcement



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- Description of the position for which the department is searching
- Means of marketing the position to potential candidates and is critical for generating interest in the position

Position announcement



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- **Qualifications and Job Performance Attributes**
 - Start with a newly define position that addresses current and future needs
 - Faculty/committee should be closely involved in the development of the qualifications
 - All stated qualifications have to be directly related to identified needs and functions of the position
 - Limit required qualifications to those that a candidate must absolutely have

Position announcement



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- **Qualifications and Job Performance Attributes (cont.)**
 - Include a qualification that speaks to the candidate's ability to work effectively with diverse groups of students, faculty and staff
 - Define qualifications broadly enough to be able to consider additional information (e.g. degree in related discipline)
 - Identify attributes that are necessary or relevant to success in the position (e.g. ability to secure research funding, collaborate in interdisciplinary teams...)

Position announcement



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- Marketing the position
 - Make announcement clear and focused
 - Convey department directions and initiatives
 - Provide context as to how the position fits within the larger organization
 - Address the importance of diversity to the position (e.g. demonstrable ability to mentor students from diverse backgrounds...)
 - Describe the benefits of the community as inclusive as possible

The advertisement



- Means
 - Printed or electronic
 - **National Professional Journal**
- Content
 - Job title
 - Job duties
 - Educational requirements
 - Experience requirements (not required)
- ISFS will review ads for Department of Labor (DOL) compliance
- Advertise for a minimum of 30 days

The advertisement



- Additional online recruiting resources
 - HigherEdJobs.com
 - Workplace Diversity
 - Contact Human Resources for postings
 - Chronicle of Higher Education
- ListServes
 - See DoF Search Committee Handbook

During the application period



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- All applicants' information must be entered into the applicant tracking log (DOF portal) as applications come in
- They will receive an email informing them that their application has been received as well as information required by federal law:
 - Clery Annual Security Report
 - Campus Fire Safety Report
 - Self ID form (EEO report)
 - Notice of non-discrimination

First steps to a successful search



Continuously Prepare to Hire

- Have long range plans for the department
- Consider unit's goals, strategic plan, and priorities (department, college, university)
- Consider interdisciplinary opportunities as appropriate

Always be recruiting



Recruiting begins before you have a position

- Network directly with young scholars, including your own students- Invite them to speak
- Pre-interview promising scholars at conferences to encourage entry into academia and to apply to Texas A&M
- Actively pursue candidates thriving at less well-ranked institutions
- Ask colleagues at other institutions for names of promising candidates
- Widen the pool from which you recruit

Why is diversity important?



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- It gives us access to talent currently not represented
- More perspectives are taken into account in devising solutions to problems
- Diverse faculty/administrators serve as role models for a diverse student body
- We potentially exclude individuals of excellence



ADVANCE CENTER
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

Recruitment of excellent faculty – it takes a leader



- Enhancing diversity enhances excellence
- Overcoming unintentional biases in the recruitment process
- Creating positive department climate increases successful recruitment and retention

Increasing diversity in the applicant pool



- “Women, minorities, individuals with disabilities, and veterans are encouraged to apply.”
- “The college is especially interested in qualified candidates who can contribute, through their research, teaching, and/or service, to the diversity and excellence of the academic community.”
- “The College of Veterinary Medicine at Purdue University values, nurtures, and respects all members of its community and ensures an environment of inclusive excellence where all students, faculty, and staff are inspired and empowered to achieve their full potential. Purdue University is an EEOAA employer fully committed to achieving a diverse work force. All individuals, including minorities, individuals with disabilities, and protected veterans are encouraged to apply.”

Increasing diversity in the applicant pool



- Advertise for longer than 30 days
- Ask faculty and graduate students to help identify women and minority candidates
- Contact colleagues at other institutions to seek nominations
- Make personal contacts with women and minority candidates
- Contact successful faculty at smaller institutions
- Place announcements in media aimed specifically at underrepresented minorities and women

Mental models



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

All of us – men and women – perceive and treat people differently based on their social groups (schemas, stereotypes)

This is implicit or unintentional bias



ADVANCE CENTER
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

Orchestrating impartiality: The impact of “blind” auditions on female musicians



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

Analysis of audition records of 14,000 musicians for positions in major US symphony orchestras during 1970-1996:

- Use of blind auditions increases the probability that a woman will advance from preliminary rounds by 50%
- Roster data from 11 major orchestras show the switch to blind auditions accounts for 30% of the increase in the proportion of women among new hires



Implicit bias



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY



https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fL9__gD88xk

Why are we unaware of implicit biases?



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

- We view ourselves as fair and impartial
- We believe advancement is merit-based
- We admire the competence of some, which seems to show that we are free of bias
- We perceive that evaluations are basically fair because some make it to the top
 - We have the sense that the truly capable succeed
 - It is hard to remember that an exception is just that: an atypical event, and therefore actually evidence that the norm is different



ADVANCE CENTER
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

What can search committees do?



Active strategies to overcome implicit bias in the search process:

- Active Search
 - “it’s a search not a sort”
- Search committee composition
 - diverse committee
- Inclusive advertising
- Thoughtful evaluation of candidates
- Host an effective visit



Thoughtful evaluation of candidates



- Be aware of your mental models and how they affect evaluation; make sure your committee works to actively counteract it
- Discuss and define what excellence is and how it will be assessed for all candidates
- Discuss and define evaluation criteria in advance
- Design organized evaluations that combine examination of written materials and direct contact with the candidate

PAUSE

- **P**ay attention
- **A**sk yourself about bias
- **U**nderstand how bias affects your decisions
- **S**low down
- **E**valuate candidates



Consider only job-relevant criteria



- Search committee should only evaluate qualifications that are relevant to the position – questions about matters that are not job relevant (e.g., family status) are not appropriate
- Search committee members should not seek or discuss information about the existence of a dual-career partner or family status of the candidate
- See the list of appropriate interview questions



When are implicit biases most likely to operate?



- Under important time pressure
- When the task involves ambiguity
- When information is incomplete
- Non-verbal automatic processes
 - e.g. creating yes/no piles of CVs



Evaluating candidates



Before evaluating

- Identify key characteristics that must be met
- Identify additional characteristics that are desirable
- Turn qualifications into selection criteria:
 - develop criteria/rubrics for sorting candidates
 - establish consistency regarding the weight or importance of each criteria
- Consider size of candidate pool

While evaluating

- Review candidates in a uniform manner

Evaluating candidates



Steps to maintain a diverse pool

- Work to minimize the effects of unconscious and conscious stereotypes
- Consider candidates who have non-traditional educational or employment history
- Consider candidates who have excelled at their research in less-highly-ranked departments
- Do not make assumptions about a person's willingness to move
- Be careful of unsubstantiated information (rumors, prejudgments, etc.)

Use an evaluation tool



Applicant Evaluation Tool for Search Committees

The following offers a method for department faculty to provide evaluations of job applicants. **It is meant to be a template for departments that they can modify as necessary for their own uses.** The proposed questions are designed for junior faculty candidates; however, alternate language is suggested in parenthesis for senior faculty candidates.

Applicant's Name: _____

Please indicate which of the following are true for you (check all that apply):

- Read applicant's CV
- Read applicant's statements (research, teaching, etc.)
- Read applicant's letters of recommendation
- Read applicant's scholarship (indicate what): _____

Please rate the applicant on each of the following:

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	Unable to Judge
Evidence of research productivity					
Potential for scholarly impact / tenurability					
Evidence of strong background in [relevant fields]					
Evidence of [particular] perspective on [particular area]					
Evidence of teaching experience and interest (including grad mentorship)					
Potential to teach key departmental courses					
Potential to contribute to the mission of the department/college					
Contributes to the diversity of the department					
Potential to teach the core curriculum on [particular area] (including creation of new courses)					

Other comments:

Interviewer Evaluation Tool

The following offers a method for department faculty to provide evaluations of job candidates. **It is meant to be a template for departments that they can modify as necessary for their own uses.** The proposed questions are designed for junior faculty candidates; however, alternate language is suggested in parenthesis for senior faculty candidates.

Candidate's Name: _____

Please indicate which of the following are true for you (check all that apply):

- Read candidate's CV
- Read candidate's scholarship
- Read candidate's letters of recommendation
- Attended candidate's job talk
- Met with candidate
- Attended lunch or dinner with candidate
- Other (please explain): _____

Please comment on the candidate's scholarship:

Please comment on the candidate's teaching ability:

Please rate the candidate on each of the following:

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	Unable to Judge
Potential for (Evidence of) scholarly impact					
Potential for (Evidence of) research productivity					
Potential for (Evidence of) research funding					
Potential for (Evidence of) collaboration					
Fit with department's priorities					
Ability to make positive contribution to department's climate					
Potential (Demonstrated ability) to attract and supervise graduate students					
Potential (Demonstrated ability) to teach and supervise undergraduates					
Potential (Demonstrated ability) to be a conscientious university community member					

Other comments:

References



- Phone interview from candidate's reference list
 - Design a clear and well structure process for contacting references:
 - Prepare uniform questions ahead of time
 - Include multiple search committee members in reference check
 - Ask for specific examples
 - Contact multiple references
 - Reconfirm negative information (especially if unsolicited)

References



- Ask candidates permissions to go **off-list**
 - Either specific people or general agreement
 - [Off-List references: The Chronicle of Higher Education \(http://www.chronicle.com/article/Off-List-References/143595/\)](http://www.chronicle.com/article/Off-List-References/143595/)
- Contact off-list references only for small group of finalists
 - If confidentiality needed can wait until about to extend offer
 - If public interview has been announced no need to wait
- Reconfirm negative information (especially if unsolicited)

Pre-interview tips



- Try to interview more than one female and/or minority candidate
- Consider conducting phone interviews with high number of candidates before inviting finalists to campus
- Consider inviting more than three candidates to campus

Hosting interviews



Preparing for campus visit

- Dean must approve short list
- Establish a common set of meetings and activities for all candidates
- Establish appropriate format for the committee report

Host an effective visit



During the Campus Visit

- Host warmly and with enthusiasm
- Allow the candidate to check us out
- Make sure all interviewers know what questions **NOT** to ask
- Accommodate preferences/special needs as appropriate

Host an effective visit



- Treat all applicants as valuable candidates, not representatives of a group
- Ensure that all candidates meet a diverse group of people
- Offer time on the schedule to meet with TAMU representatives of their choice (faculty and staff networks: <http://diversity.tamu.edu/Campus-Resources/Faculty-Staff>)

Host an effective visit



- Dual career program:
 - <https://advance.tamu.edu/dual-career-program-information/>
- Family friendly policies:
 - <http://dof.tamu.edu/Faculty-Resources/CURRENT-FACULTY/Faculty-Work-Life>

Do you have a partner who will be coming on the visit and might want to learn more about job options here?



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

This university and department are really supportive of my partner's job search.

"Obviously they didn't want to offer a job to someone who was going to have a problem."

"I got nonstop questions about family issues from the faculty. Nobody asked my husband about family issues."

This is a friendly department where everyone helps one another out.



"I might choose to live in a different place from my husband. I was not treated equally."



ADVANCE CENTER
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

Do you have school-aged children or do you want to learn more about schools here?



This university, this department, and the faculty are family-friendly.

"I figured the reason they asked me about whether I had kids was that they wanted to figure out whether it would be hard for me to move. Obviously it was a negative."

This is a great place to raise a family.

"A senior male asked me if I was going to have children. Just like that. I said what I was trained to say: No."



Closing the deal!



- The Department Head
- Faculty and Search Committee should stay engaged
- Dual Career services

Making the hire



Offer Letter

- Make sure offer letter includes needed disclaimers:
 - Pending administrative approval
 - Pending documentation of employment eligibility—degree verification, background check, selective service compliance
 - Tenure on arrival pending approval by the BOR

Making the hire



Start-up Funds

- Negotiated through Provost Office
- AgriLife Research
- TEES

Reporting Interview Outcomes

- Notify the Dean of Faculties Office whether accepted or declined (use the candidate tracking log)

Initiating the retention process



- Retention starts at the time of hire
- Most critical time occurs during the first six months to the first year
- Stay engaged with faculty
- Work to avoid the “revolving door”

Special considerations



DEAN OF FACULTIES
TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

Hiring international faculty

Office of International Faculty and Scholar Services

Special handling



- Is the recruitment of international faculty different?
 - Same advertisement
 - Same selection and recruitment process
 - Same hiring process
- Special Handling Labor Certification
 - Requires test of the labor market

What is special handling



A test of the Labor Market

- Department of Labor allows university to use its normal recruitment and selection process
- TAMU has already undergone the process of testing the labor market for faculty with actual teaching responsibilities
- File application within 18 months from the date of the offer letter

Some post hiring killers



- No copy or verification of the advertisement
- Deficient advertisement
 - Less than 30 days
 - Not in a professional journal
- Offer and amended offer letter
- Documentation provided too late for filing the application before the 18 months deadline
- Irregularities in the recruitment process
- Individual not meeting experience requirement

Records retention



Keep records (paper or electronic) in department

Retention period is 5 years

Suggested sample list of information to keep:

- Applications, recommendation letters, and any other materials submitted by each applicant
- Description of the selection process
- Description of the interview process
- List of names of candidates interviewed
- Selection process of the appointee
- Copies of itineraries of all candidates interviewed
- Applicant Tracking Log

